



Standards and Certification Training

Module B – Process

B5 Consensus Process for Standards Development

REVISIONS

DATE	CHANGE
09/13/2024	Updated to align to Rev. 19 of Operating Procedures for ASME Codes and Standards Development Committees
12/14/2016	Editorially revised and restructured presentation as well as added slides for "Stabilized Maintenance"
9/20/13	Revised the format throughout. Deleted Slides 4, 5, 9, 10, 11, 13, 14, 18, 25, 26, 34, 39 and 42 to consolidate and remove pop quizzes. Revised all other slides to allow for learning objectives and module summary , references to periodic maintenance, and to improve the flow of the Module.
11/22/10	Changed "Codes and Standards Board of Directors" to "Council on Standards and Certification" throughout.

MODULE B COURSE OUTLINE

- B1. ASME Organizational Structure
- B2. Standards Development: Staff and Volunteer Roles and Responsibilities
- B3. Conformity Assessment: Staff and Volunteer Roles and Responsibilities
- B4. Initiating and Terminating Standards Projects
- B5. Consensus Process for Standards Development**
- B5A. Standards & Certification Project Management
- B6. The Basics of Parliamentary Procedure
- B7. The Appeals Process
- B8. International Standards Development
- B9. ASME Conformity Assessment Programs
- B10. Performance Based Standards
- B11. Consensus Process for Standards Interpretation and Code Cases (under development)

LEARNING OBJECTIVES

At the end of this module, you will be able to:

- Understand the definition and key principles of consensus
- Define the steps in the standards development and approval process
- Understand the role of ANSI and the use of ASME's ANSI-accredited procedure for developing standards by consensus

CONSENSUS ON STANDARDS ACTIONS

- Consensus as defined by ASME and ANSI means that the standards committee has achieved:
 - A substantial agreement reached by directly and materially affected parties. This signifies the concurrence of more than a simple majority, but not necessarily unanimity. Consensus requires that all views and objections be considered, and that an effort be made toward their resolution.

KEY PRINCIPLES OF The CONSENSUS PROCESS

- Openness
- Transparency
- Balance of Interest
 - Examples of interest categories include:
 - Manufacturers
 - Installers
 - Regulatory
 - Insurance/Inspection
 - General Interest
 - Designers
 - Owners
- Due Process

STANDARDS ACTIONS

- Types:
 - New standard
 - Revision
 - Reaffirmation
 - Withdrawal
 - Stabilized Maintenance
 - National Adoption of an ISO or IEC Standard

STANDARDS COMMITTEE PROCEDURES

- ASME's current, ANSI-accredited procedures
- Committees have operating guides which may include:
 - Committee specific preferences
 - Administrative guidelines

MAINTENANCE OF STANDARDS

- Continuous Maintenance
 - The maintenance of a standard by consideration of recommended changes to any part of it according to a documented schedule for consideration and action by the consensus body
- Periodic Maintenance
 - The maintenance of a standard by review of the entire document and action to revise or reaffirm it on a schedule not to exceed five years from the date of its approval as an American National Standard
- Stabilized Maintenance
 - Requires a status review of the entire document by the standards committee every 10 years

CONTINUOUS AND PERIODIC MAINTENANCE

- Revise or reaffirm the ANS within 5 years of previous approval
 - **Continuous Maintenance.**
 - Public review (BSR-8) must be submitted to ANSI within 5 years of previous approval or,
 - A request for extension (BSR-11) shall be submitted, but the standard must then be maintained under periodic maintenance
 - **Periodic Maintenance.**
 - Project Initiation Notification (PINs) or public review document (BSR-8) must be submitted to ANSI within 5 years of the previous approval or,
 - A request for extension (BSR-11) shall be submitted to ANSI

STABILIZED MAINTENANCE

- Requires status review every 10 years.
- Eligibility criteria:
 - Address a mature technology or practice(s)
 - Unrelated to safety or health
 - Currently designated as an ANS and has been reaffirmed at least once
 - Most recent edition was approved by ANSI at least ten years prior
 - Required for use in connection with existing implementations or for reference purposes

MAINTENANCE OF STANDARDS

Standards under continuous or periodic maintenance not revised or reaffirmed within 10 years will lose their status as an American National Standard

THE STANDARDS DEVELOPMENT PROCESS

- Initiation & Development of a standards action
- Consensus committee approval
- Public review
- Supervisory Board approval
- Opportunity for Appeals
- ANSI approval
- Publication

INITIATION & DEVELOPMENT OF A STANDARDS ACTION

- Request for standards action is received or a periodic maintenance review is scheduled
- Project Team is established
 - See Module B5a for information on Standards & Certification Project Management
- ANSI Project Initiation Notification System (PINS) is filed, if applicable
 - See Module B4 for information on Initiating and Terminating Standards Projects

THE STANDARDS DEVELOPMENT PROCESS

- Initiating & Development of a standards action
- **Consensus committee approval**
- Public review
- Supervisory Board approval
- Appeals
- ANSI approval
- Publication

CONSENSUS COMMITTEE APPROVAL

- Recorded vote
 - First consideration ballot (4-6 weeks)
 - Votes shall be recorded in C&S Connect
 - Votes may take place at a meeting, but all voting members are provided the opportunity to vote via C&S connect after the meeting
 - The Supervisory Board is included for review and comment
 - Item passes on a first consideration ballot with no disapproved votes and minimum 2/3 affirmative votes, provided greater than 50% of the total consensus body has voted approved.

CONSENSUS COMMITTEE APPROVAL

- Voting options Approved (with or without comment)
 - Disapproved (with comment)
 - The committee is not responsible for resolving disapproved votes without comment
 - Not Voting
 - Indicates conflict of interest
 - Reduces the voting tally for the action being voted on
 - Abstain
 - Indicates a lack of expertise or an insufficient review
 - Does not reduce the voting tally for the action being voted on

CONSENSUS COMMITTEE APPROVAL

- Resolution of ballot comments on first consideration
 - The committee shall attempt to resolve all disapproved comments and consider all other comments related to the proposal
 - The committee must respond to all comments related to the proposal
 - Technical and editorial changes to the proposal are submitted to the committee for consideration
 - Editorial changes may be approved at a meeting, provided a quorum is present
 - Technical changes, made to the proposal in an attempt to resolve the ballot comments, are submitted to the committee for a recirculation ballot or new first consideration ballot

CONSENSUS COMMITTEE APPROVAL

- Recirculation Ballot
 - Committee members may change votes during the voting period
 - New disapproved votes shall only be permitted for:
 - In support of first consideration disapproved votes or any substantive Supervisory Board comments
 - Disagreement with changes introduced in the proposal
 - Action passes with a minimum of 2/3 affirmative vote, provided greater than 50% of the total consensus body has voted approved.
 - Unresolved Disapproved votes (if any)
 - Notification of the Right to Appeal

CONSENSUS COMMITTEE APPROVAL

- Withdrawing or holding an approved standards action
 - Consensus committee has ability to hold or withdraw approved standards action
 - Action must be initiated prior to submittal for ANSI approval
 - Approval of 2/3 of the consensus committee membership is required, provided greater than 50% of the total consensus body has voted approved.
 - Supervisory Board approval is required if approved standards action has already been submitted for Board procedural approval
 - Vote can be taken at a meeting

EDITORIAL REVISIONS

- Editorial revisions may be approved by:
 - Ballot (same as for standards actions), or
 - Recorded vote at meeting where quorum is present
 - Members may disapprove in disagreement with change or asserting change is not editorial
 - 2/3 approval of consensus committee members present required, provided greater than 50% of the total consensus body has voted approved.
 - If not approved, must be processed as standards action or withdrawn

THE STANDARDS DEVELOPMENT PROCESS

- Initiating & Development of a standards action
- Consensus committee approval
- **Public review**
- Supervisory Board approval
- Appeals
- ANSI approval
- Publication

PUBLIC REVIEW

- All proposed standards actions must be announced for public review
 - C&S website
 - ANSI's Standards Action (for American National Standards)
- Can be conducted concurrently with committee vote

PUBLIC REVIEW

- Comment period is determined by accessibility of the details (60, 45, 30 days)
- Attempt resolution of comments (if any)
 - All comments must be responded to
 - Technically revised proposals require further consensus committee recorded vote and another public review
- Unresolved objections are submitted to the committee for recirculation vote
- Commenters with unresolved objections are notified of their right to appeal

THE STANDARDS DEVELOPMENT PROCESS

- Initiating & Development of a standards action
- Consensus committee approval
- Public review
- **Supervisory Board approval**
- Appeals
- ANSI approval
- Publication

SUPERVISORY BOARD APPROVAL

- Supervisory Board Procedural Ballot[‡]
 - Conducted after consensus committee approval.
 - Verifies adherence to policies, procedures and the committee charter
 - If there is a concern where the safety, health, or welfare of the public is believed to be endangered, this may be brought up during this ballot
- Administrative Approval
 - Proposals without any unresolved consensus body disapproved votes, unresolved substantive comments, or unresolved public review objection

THE STANDARDS DEVELOPMENT PROCESS

- Initiating & Development of a standards action
- Consensus committee approval
- Public review
- Supervisory Board approval
- Appeals
- ANSI approval
- Publication

APPEALS

- ASME affords an individual the right to appeal any action or inaction. The process is detailed in depth in Module B7
- ANSI appeals process
 - Not heard until
 - Standard Development Organization's appeal process completed
 - ANSI has taken action on approval
 - May also appeal Standard Development Organization's ANSI accreditation

THE STANDARDS DEVELOPMENT PROCESS

- Initiating & Development of a standards action
- Consensus committee approval
- Public review
- Supervisory Board approval
- Appeals
- **ANSI approval**
- Publication

ANSI APPROVAL

- ANSI is responsible for overseeing the process by which American National Standards are developed
 - accredits standards developers
 - provides a venue for public review of proposed standards actions
 - approves proposed standards actions, and
 - audits standards developers approximately every 5 years
- ASME usually submits standards to ANSI for approval as American National Standards

ANSI APPROVAL

- Proposed standards action submitted to ANSI Board of Standards Review (BSR)
- Documentation provided includes committee roster and how each member voted
- Technical issues are only considered from viewpoint where they afforded due process
- Administrative vs. Formal approval
 - Administrative: No BSR vote
 - Permitted only if no unresolved disapproved votes, unresolved substantive comments, or no public review objections
 - Formal: Requires BSR vote

THE STANDARDS DEVELOPMENT PROCESS

- Initiating & Development of a standards action
- Consensus committee approval
- Public review
- Supervisory Board approval
- Appeals
- ANSI approval
- **Publication**

PUBLICATION

- Prior to ANSI approval:
 - ASME Publication Staff receives a draft of the standard
 - ASME Staff Secretary and Project Manager (PM) will update the publication staff with any changes (if applicable)
 - The staff and PM will have an opportunity to review the document prior to printing
- After ANSI approval, ASME publishes the standard.
 - American National Standards must be published no later than six months after approval as an American National Standard

MODULE SUMMARY

- Consensus means substantial agreement by affected interest categories, consideration of views and attempted resolution. Unanimity is not required
- The Steps in the standards development and approval process include development of a standards action, recorded vote, public review, Supervisory Board approval, ANSI approval and publication
- ANSI is responsible for overseeing the process by which American National Standards are developed. ANSI accredits standards developers, provides a venue for public review of proposed standards actions, approves proposed standards actions and audits standards developers approximately every 5 years

REFERENCES

- Operating Procedures for ASME Codes and Standards Development Committees (Primarily Section 74.2)

<http://cstools.asme.org/csconnect/CommitteePages.cfm?Committee=L01200000&Action=7609>

- <https://cstools.asme.org/csconnect/CommitteePages.cfm?Committee=L01200000&Action=7609&ChooseTemplate=12716>

- ~~Codes and Standards Policy CSP 52, Policy for Consideration of Standards Actions by Supervisory Boards~~

<http://cstools.asme.org/csconnect/CommitteePages.cfm?Committee=L01200000&Action=7609>

- Supervisory Board Procedures

<http://cstools.asme.org/csconnect/committeepages.cfm>

- S&C Training Module B5a

<http://cstools.asme.org/trainingmodules.cfm>